

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

Minutes of a meeting of the Planning Committee held on
Wednesday, 12 February 2020 at 10.30 a.m.

PRESENT: Councillor John Batchelor – Chairman
Councillor Pippa Heylings – Vice-Chairman

Councillors: Anna Bradnam
Peter Fane
Judith Rippeth
Heather Williams
Dr. Martin Cahn
Brian Milnes
Deborah Roberts
Nick Wright

Officers in attendance for all or part of the meeting:

Julie Ayre (Planning Team Leader (East)), Katie Christodoulides (Senior Planning Officer), Alistair Funge (Planning Enforcement Officer), Stephen Kelly (Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development), Rory McKenna (Deputy Head of Legal Practice), Stephen Reid (Senior Planning Lawyer), Aaron Sands (Senior Planning Officer), Ian Senior (Democratic Services Officer) and Andrew Thompson (Planning Officer)

Councillors Sarah Cheung Johnson and Neil Gough were in attendance, by invitation.

1. APOLOGIES

Councillor Sue Ellington sent Apologies for Absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest.

3. RECORDED VOTING

Upon the proposal of Councillor Brian Milnes,, seconded by Councillor Peter Fane, the Committee unanimously agreed that all substantive votes at the current Planning Committee meeting should be recorded by name and / or number and name.

4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

The Committee authorised the Chairman to sign, as a correct record, the minutes of the Extraordinary meeting held on 24 October 2019.

The Committee authorised the Chairman to sign, as a correct record, the minutes of the meeting held on 15 January 2020 subject as follows:

Minute 5 – S/4298/18/FL – Willingham

In paragraph 5 replace “The Committee...” with “Councillor Nick Wright...”

5. PLANNING SCHEME OF DELEGATION

The Planning Committee considered a report from the Director of Planning and Economic Development and the Monitoring Officer seeking its approval of the updated powers and functions it delegates to officers, as set out in Appendix A to that report.

Following a presentation from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development, Members engaged in a wide-ranging debate surrounding the options outlined in the report. The principal points raised were as follows:

- The Local Planning Authority should improve public perception that it recognises and respects the concerns and aspirations of Parish Councils and residents
- Members had had insufficient time in which to consider the options fully, and it was essential that the review should be conducted over such period as to allow an informed decision to be made.
- The review of delegation had to retain enough flexibility to protect South Cambridgeshire District Council's five-year housing land supply
- If applications that Parish Councils want presented to Committee are instead dealt with under delegation, Parish Councils should be told why

The Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development highlighted the potentially broad range of material considerations used to consider the basis for referral of applications to the Committee. He emphasised instead the importance of officers using their professional judgment to assess the relevant factors involved on an application by application basis.

Councillor Heather Williams proposed, and Councillor Deborah Roberts seconded, the following amendment to the Recommendation

“The receipt of a request for call in by a parish council within 21 days, or a member within 28 days, of notification is referred automatically to Committee - where material planning considerations are cited by the parish or member for seeking such a decision

This will take place for the next 6 weeks to allow full scrutiny and time to digest a way forward given the short time we have had to assess the options. During this six weeks the committee will sit more often, as often as is necessary, to ensure decisions are not delayed.”

Upon a show of hands, this amendment was lost by seven votes to three. Councillors Roberts, Heather Williams and Wright supported the amendment. Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane, Heylings, Milnes and Rippeth voted to refuse the amendment.

Members discussed timescales for receiving back a further report. The Monitoring Officer asked Members instead to consider allowing officers a reasonable length of time to finalise proposals without imposing a deadline on them.

The Planning Committee

1. By five votes to four with one abstention, approved Option 1 in the second agenda supplement namely to amend paragraph 1 in Appendix A to the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development contained in the main agenda (dated 4 February 2020) to read as follows:

“A Local Member or Parish Council writes, or emails a request for a particular application to be considered by Planning Committee, and sound planning reasons are given for why this is considered necessary and the request is accepted by the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development, in consultation with the Chairman of Planning Committee (or

Vice-Chair in his/her absence).”

Footnote - Notwithstanding any decision is ultimately one for the officer himself/herself, the committee’s guidance in terms of decisions made in accordance with the delegation rules is that in cases which raise issues which are sensitive or controversial, the committee would expect the officer normally to refer the matter to the committee.

(Councillor John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane and Heylings voted to approve. Councillors Rippeth, Roberts, Heather Williams and Wright voted against. Councillor Milnes abstained.)

2. By eight votes to two, approved the remainder of the tracked changes in Appendix A to the report in the main agenda.
3. Unanimously, instructed officers to submit for its consideration as soon as possible the draft terms of reference for the Planning Advisory Service review and that they report back to Committee with the recommendations arising from that review to either an ordinary or extraordinary meeting by no later than the end of June 2020.

6. **S/3499/19/RM - LONGSTANTON / OAKINGTON (PHASE 2A, NORTHSTOWE)**

Members visited the site on 11 February 2020.

Mark Latham (Urban Splash) and Councillor Sarah Cheung Johnson (a local Member) addressed the meeting.

The Committee noted that improved delivery times were likely because the nature of the buildings’ construction off site meant that that could take place at the same time as groundwork on site. The Committee also received an assurance that cladding used would be non-flammable. Members noted local concern about the impact on the residents of Rampton Drift of three-storey dwellings proposed for the edge of this development.

Further debate focussed on

- The provision of bat boxes, and bird boxes designed to attract a wider variety of birdlife
- The key importance of both age-restricted accommodation and the modular construction of the housing
- The need for careful consideration to be given to building heights so as to protect as far as possible the amenity of residents in Rampton Drift

A proposal from Councillor Deborah Roberts, seconded by Councillor Heather Williams, to defer making a decision until the issue of building heights had been resolved was lost by six votes to three with one abstention.

Planning Committee

1. By seven votes to three **approved** Part A of the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development - Reserved Matters to Phase 2A of Northstowe subject to conditions outlined in the report and an additional highways condition following receipt of further late comments;
(Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane, Heylings, Milnes and Rippeth

voted for approval. Councillors Roberts, Heather Williams and Wright voted to refuse.)

2. By seven votes to three **approved** Part B of the report - Discharge Conditions 9, 10, 11, 12, 19, 20, 23, 24, 27, 31, 32, 33, 34, 38, 41, 42, 43, 45, 48, 57 and 64 of outline planning permission S/2011/14/OL, subject to the implementation of the agreed details; and
(Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane, Heylings, Milnes and Rippeth voted for approval. Councillors Roberts, Heather Williams and Wright voted to refuse.)
3. Unanimously **approved** Part C of the report - Temporary change of use of two dwellings to show homes.

**During Item 7 of this agenda
(S/2549/19/RM - Cottenham)
and in accordance with
Standing Orders, the
Committee agreed by
affirmation that the meeting
should continue beyond four
hours.**

7. S/2549/19/RM - COTTENHAM (LAND OFF RAMPTON ROAD)

Members visited the site on 11 February 2020.

Michael Brown (objector), John Dudding (applicant's agent), Councillor Frank Morris (Cottenham Parish Council) and Councillor Neigh Gough (local Member speaking on behalf of himself and Councillor Eileen Wilson, the other local Member) addressed the meeting.

The case officer updated the Committee. Late representations had already been addressed in the report. The Local Highways Authority had now changed its recommendation to approval. Ecology and Urban Design Officers were supportive of the application.

In response to Members' concern about ongoing management and maintenance of the drainage system, the Delivery Manager (Strategic Sites) said that these matters were not in the gift of the Local Highways Authority.

Councillor Deborah Roberts said that this application was premature. The proposal was seconded and, following a short debate, the motion was put to a vote on the basis of the application being against the Village Design Statement, permeability with the adjacent site, layout and the likelihood of the estate roads not being adopted. The vote was five in favour of deferral (Councillors Heylings, Milnes, Rippeth, Roberts and Heather Williams) and five against (Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane and Wright). The Chairman exercised his casting vote against deferral so the motion was lost.

By seven votes to three, the Planning Committee resolved to **approve** the application subject to the Conditions and informatives contained in the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development and, by five votes to one with three abstentions, to the addition of the following Condition:

“No development shall begin until a surface water drainage scheme for the site, based on sustainable drainage principles, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall subsequently be implemented in accordance with the approved details before the relevant part of the scheme (including all strategic elements which will benefit all dwellings) and that part which is particular to an individual dwelling shall subsequently be implemented in accordance with the approved details before an application is made for a final certificate for building regulation purposes and no dwellings shall be occupied unless the relevant part of the said scheme has been implemented to the reasonable satisfaction of the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall be based upon the principles within the agreed Flood Risk Assessment (FRA) prepared by Enzygo (ref: SHF.1132.024.HY.R.001.G dated August 2016 and shall also include: -

- i) Full calculations detailing the existing surface water runoff rates for the QBAR, 3.3 % Annual Exceedance Probability (AEP) (1 in 30) and 1% AEP (1 in 100) storm events.
- ii) Full results of the proposed drainage system modelling in the above-referenced storm events (as well as 1% AEP plus climate change) , inclusive of all collection, conveyance, storage, flow control and disposal elements and including an allowance for urban creep, together with an assessment of system performance.
- iii) Detailed drawings of the entire proposed surface water drainage system, including levels, gradients, dimensions and pipe reference numbers.
- iv) Full details of the proposed attenuation and flow control measures.
- v) Site Investigation and test results to confirm infiltration rates.
- vi) Details of overland flood flow routes in the event of system exceedance, with demonstration that such flows can be appropriately managed on site without increasing flood risk to occupants.
- vii) Full details of the maintenance/adoption of the surface water drainage system.
- viii) Measures taken to prevent pollution of the receiving groundwater and/or surface water.

The drainage scheme must adhere to the hierarchy of drainage options as outlined in the NPPF PPG.

(Reason - To ensure a satisfactory method of surface water drainage and to prevent the increased risk of flooding in accordance with Policy CC/8 of the adopted Local Plan 2018.)”

(Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane, Heylings, Milnes and Rippeth voted in favour. Councillors Roberts, Heather Williams and Wright voted against.)

8. **S/2679/19/RM - COTTENHAM (LAND OFF RAMPTON ROAD)**

Members noted that this was a duplicate application to application reference S/2549/19/RM (Minute 7 of the meeting held on 12 February 2020 refers).

By way of confirmation, and by seven votes to three, the Planning Committee resolved to **approve** the application subject to the Conditions and informatives contained in the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development and, by five votes to one with three abstentions, to the addition of the following Condition:

“No development shall begin until a surface water drainage scheme for the site, based on sustainable drainage principles, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall subsequently be implemented in accordance with the approved details before the relevant part of the scheme (including all strategic elements which will benefit all dwellings) and that part which is particular to an individual dwelling shall subsequently be implemented in accordance with the approved details before an application is made for a final certificate for building regulation purposes and no dwellings shall be occupied unless the relevant

part of the said scheme has been implemented to the reasonable satisfaction of the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall be based upon the principles within the agreed Flood Risk Assessment (FRA) prepared by Enzygo (ref: SHF.1132.024.HY.R.001.G dated August 2016 and shall also include: -

- i) Full calculations detailing the existing surface water runoff rates for the QBAR, 3.3 % Annual Exceedance Probability (AEP) (1 in 30) and 1% AEP (1 in 100) storm events.
- ii) Full results of the proposed drainage system modelling in the above-referenced storm events (as well as 1% AEP plus climate change) , inclusive of all collection, conveyance, storage, flow control and disposal elements and including an allowance for urban creep, together with an assessment of system performance.
- iii) Detailed drawings of the entire proposed surface water drainage system, including levels, gradients, dimensions and pipe reference numbers.
- iv) Full details of the proposed attenuation and flow control measures.
- v) Site Investigation and test results to confirm infiltration rates.
- vi) Details of overland flood flow routes in the event of system exceedance, with demonstration that such flows can be appropriately managed on site without increasing flood risk to occupants.
- vii) Full details of the maintenance/adoption of the surface water drainage system.
- viii) Measures taken to prevent pollution of the receiving groundwater and/or surface water.

The drainage scheme must adhere to the hierarchy of drainage options as outlined in the NPPF PPG.

(Reason - To ensure a satisfactory method of surface water drainage and to prevent the increased risk of flooding in accordance with Policy CC/8 of the adopted Local Plan 2018.)”

(Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Fane, Heylings, Milnes and Rippeth voted in favour. Councillors Roberts, Heather Williams and Wright voted against)

Councillor John Batchelor left the meeting. Councillor Pippa Heylings took the Chair for the remainder of the meeting. By affirmation, the Committee appointed Councillor Brian Milnes as Vice-Chairman for the remainder of the meeting.

9. S/3344/19/FL - KNAPWELL (12 HIGH STREET)

Members noted that this application had been **withdrawn** from the agenda.

10. S/2513/19/FL - SWAVESEY (WHITE WILLOWS, HALE RD)

Members visited the site on 11 February 2020.

Mr. Ratcliffe (applicant) and Councillor Will Wright (Swavesey Parish Council) addressed the meeting. Members also received an e-mail from Henry Doble (applicant’s agent).

Councillor Deborah Roberts pointed out the conflict between this application and the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018, The site was outside the Village Framework and

the District Council now had a five-year housing land supply.

The Committee **refused** the application for the reasons set out in the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development.

(Councillor Deborah Roberts paid tribute to Aaron Sands, the case officer, who was leaving South Cambridgeshire District Council to join Huntingdonshire District Council as a Planner. The Committee expressed its appreciation of Aaron Sands' work for the Planning Committee over the years.)

11. MS/3732/19/FL - MADINGLEY (BELVOIR COTTAGE, THE AVENUE)

Members noted that this application had been **withdrawn** from the agenda.

12. S/3798/19/FL - THRILOW (DUXFORD SERVICE STATION, CAR SHOWROOM AND GARAGE, NEWMARKET ROAD)

Members visited the site on 11 February 2020.

The Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development had endorsed referral of this application to the Committee because of its significance in relation to the delegation policy.

Councillor Mark Brogan (Thriplow Parish Council) addressed the meeting.

Members engaged in a short debate exploring the possibility of installing shielding around the floodlights as a way of minimising the impact on neighbouring residents.

By six votes to two, with one abstention, the Planning Committee **approved** the application subject to the Conditions set out in the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development.

(Councillors Bradnam, Cahn, Fane, Heylings, Milnes and Rippeth voted to approve the application. Councillor Heather Williams and Wright voted to refuse. Councillor Roberts abstained and Councillor John Batchelor was not present.)

13. ENFORCEMENT REPORT

The Committee **received and noted** an Update on enforcement action.

The Delivery Manager (Strategic Sites) said that officers were currently preparing a report setting out the current situation at Smithy Fen in Cottenham.

14. APPEALS AGAINST PLANNING DECISIONS AND ENFORCEMENT ACTION

The Committee **received** a report on appeals against planning decisions and enforcement action, and **noted** that each of those appeals had been dismissed.

The Meeting ended at 4.40 p.m.
